

氏名	今西 静葉
学位の種類	博士（人間文化科学）
学位記番号	甲第人 24 号
学位授与年月日	2021（令和 3）年 3 月 17 日
学位授与の要件	東京女子大学学位規程第 3 条第 3 項第 1 号
学位論文題目	George MacDonald's Shadow: Spiritual Progress in the Fairy Tales ジョージ・マクドナルドの影：フェアリー・テイルにおける精神のプログレス
論文審査委員	主査 教授 Kleitz, Dorsey 副査 教授 本合 陽 副査 慶応義塾大学文学部教授 原田 範行 副査 日本女子大学家政学部児童学科教授 川端 有子

## 内容の要旨および審査の結果の要旨

### I. 論文内容の要旨

Ms. Shizuha Imanishi's doctoral dissertation, *George MacDonald's Shadow: Spiritual Progress in the Fairy Tales*, traces the trajectory in George MacDonald's fairy tales of the theme of spiritual progress. George MacDonald (1824-1905) was a Scottish writer who is regarded as one of the founders of modern fantasy writing in English. He was a mentor for Lewis Carroll, author of *Alice in Wonderland*. Organized chronologically, each chapter of the dissertation deals with fairy tales that MacDonald published beginning in Chapter 1 with the novel *Phantastes* (1858) and ending in Chapter 5 with the novel *Lilith* (1895). In analyzing spiritual progress, a key word is "shadow." The shadow appears frequently in the fairy tales. It represents the protagonist's complex changing self and is associated with various problems of desire, self-centeredness, and conceit. Ms. Imanishi's chronological and intertextual approach includes references to religious and philosophical beliefs that

were part of nineteenth-century Victorian culture.

## II. 審査の結果の要旨

### 1. 論文の構成

This dissertation consists of an introduction, five chapters, a conclusion, and a bibliography. The Introduction begins with biographical information placing MacDonald in the framework of the strict Scottish Calvinist traditions he was raised in. Ms. Imanishi then gives a definition of fairy tale based on MacDonald's use of the term. This is followed by an explanation of spiritual progress and spiritual growth. She points out that while other scholars have examined spiritual progress in individual works by MacDonald, until her study, no one has looked at the overarching development of the theme during the roughly forty years that he wrote his fairy tales. The last half of the introduction is taken up with a literature review and critical history woven into summaries of each of the five chapters of the dissertation. Here she places MacDonald's Christian fantasy in the context of Dante's *Divine Comedy*, Spenser's *The Fairie Queen*, Marlowe's *Doctor Faustus*, Milton's *Paradise Lost*, and Bunyan's *Pilgrim's Progress*.

Chapter 1, "Subjective Evil: The Narrator's Shadow in *Phantastes*," examines the journey of the main character, Anodos, in fairyland and explores the foundation of spiritual progress in MacDonald's works. Anodos's experiences reveal his immature self-centeredness and conceit. The shadow, which represents his self, is his attendant, turning trust into distrust, and promoting his desires instead of tempering them. Experiencing mistakes and encountering a variety of people, Anodos is confronted with his own immaturity. After his death in fairyland, he returns to the real world. It seems that a denial of self and self-sacrifice are related to spiritual maturity. In this way, the novel provides the starting point for a consideration of spiritual progress in MacDonald's subsequent fairy tales.

Chapter 2, "The Pursuit of the Matured Spirit in the Short Stories," focuses on MacDonald's stories published in the 1860s and explores themes related to spiritual progress inherited from *Phantastes*. The short story, "The Golden Key," articulates the idea that death leads to a new life, and in turn, is something more than life. In this story, the act of bathing not only has a purifying effect, but is also treated as death. Self-sacrifice, which functions as an element of spiritual maturity in *Phantastes*, can be found in "The Golden Key" and a related story, "The Light Princess." In "The Golden Key" an imaginative creature, an "air-fish," is linked to the fish as a traditional symbol of Christ. In the story, the air-fish turns into an

angel-like creature after being eaten, representing the idea that death is not the end of life. The importance of self-sacrifice is more clearly shown in “The Light Princess” where a princess loses her gravity due to a curse and a prince with a self-sacrificial spirit tries to save her from death. Thus, the works of the 1860s deal with self-sacrifice as a sign of spiritual maturity.

Chapter 3, “Death and Evil in MacDonald's Fairy Tales for Children,” moves to the 1870s when MacDonald published three fairy tales for children. The most important of these, *At the Back of the North Wind*, is MacDonald’s only fairy tale in which the protagonist dies at the end. In this novel, a female character named North Wind, appears as the personification of death, subverting the image of death, which is often seen as the end of life and misfortune, and transforming it into the image of a beautiful, gentle, mentor. In the afterlife, the protagonist is called an “angel” and “God’s child,” and embodies a spiritual maturity unrelated to the self-centeredness and conceit that are elements of spiritual immaturity in previous works. Through North Wind, the novel clearly shows death is also related to spiritual maturity. This chapter also explores the novel, *The Princess and the Goblin*. Here goblins represent self-centeredness, desire, and conceit. In a related short story named “The Shadow,” evil goblins represent the self as spiritual immaturity. The chapter concludes with a discussion of obstacles to spiritual progress in the novel, *The Wise Woman*. Shadows accompanying the protagonist are increasingly portrayed as independent characters such as the goblins in works of the 1870s.

Chapter 4, “Loss of Goodness in *The Princess and Curdie*” examines the loss of goodness and the evilness of the self in *The Princess and Curdie*. Self-centeredness, desire, and conceit are directly described through human beings themselves, in terms of commerce and self-interest. The novel is unique in that the evil nature is compared to that of animals, and spiritual immaturity is linked to degeneration. Self-centeredness is clearly shown in this work as spiritual degeneration that is the opposite of progress. Unlike other works, in *The Princess and Curdie* the adult characters with evil natures never convert and represent the loss of goodness. The cause of this loss is related to an obsession with acquiring wealth through commerce and self-interest that degrades and distorts human beings. The shadow, which functions as the unconscious self in *Phantastes*, transitions to the conscious self in *The Princess and Curdie*.

Chapter 5, “Death as a Metamorphosis of Spirit in *Lilith*,” focuses on MacDonald’s last fairy tale *Lilith*, which has biblical and mythological motifs. The chapter’s major themes are the evil self, which is linked to the concept of sin, and death. The

mythologically based character Lilith has a greedy self and puts it, instead of God's will, at the center of her behavior. Lilith and the main character, Vane, are both spiritually immature. Their process of reaching spiritual maturity forms the novel's plot. The symbolic character, the shadow, which haunts Lilith's desire and controls it, is described as an independent character, unlike the shadow in *Phantastes*. Here the shadow, which can be regarded as the repressed self, is an entity that does not need its subject, its owner. In *Lilith*, death is one of the elements that must be accepted in order to achieve spiritual maturity, and also serves as salvation. The analysis of the novel reveals that death is shown as salvation and that reaching death means reaching the final phase in the trajectory of spiritual progress.

The dissertation's Conclusion summarizes the main points of the text emphasizing the trajectory of the spiritual progress of the protagonists from immaturity to maturity in MacDonald's fairy tales, and reiterating the importance of the shadow in this context. The last eleven pages of the work are a comprehensive bibliography of primary and secondary sources.

## 2. 論文の特徴

An important characteristic of this dissertation is that it is based on and contains evidence of extensive and careful academic research in the Victorian period. Literary and artistic works by George MacDonald's Victorian contemporaries such as Lewis Carroll, Dante Gabriel Rossetti, and other members of the Pre-Raphaelite Brotherhood were studied to give a full understanding of MacDonald's cultural milieu. Along with this, biographical details of MacDonald's life, particularly relating to his strict Scottish Calvinist upbringing and his short career as a minister were examined. This involved researching MacDonald's sermons and letters. Sources instrumental to understanding the theme of spiritual progress include works by the twentieth century mythologist Joseph Campbell as interpreted by Christopher Vogler. Campbell's idea of the hero's journey provides a key element in Ms. Imanishi's framework for following the spiritual progress of the protagonists in MacDonald's fairy tales. The recurring motif of the shadow and its effect on the spiritual progress of the main characters in the fairy tales is another central characteristic of the dissertation.

## 3. 論文の評価

George MacDonald's fairy tale romance, *Phantastes*, published in 1858, helped to usher in the important genre of prose writing now called fantasy. According to this dissertation, the theme of *Phantastes* concerns progress toward spiritual maturity

which has its foundation in earlier Christian allegory and in MacDonald's own experiences, and which became a central element in the fairy tales he published during his long career. In examining the theme of spiritual progress, the dissertation identifies the shadow as an important element and convincingly reveals how the presence of the shadow in MacDonald's fairy tales helps the protagonists develop their spiritual identities through a process of self-sacrifice ultimately leading to death. Although the theme of spiritual progress developed throughout the dissertation is not without its weaknesses, the careful in-depth evaluations of MacDonald's individual fairy tales discussed in each chapter, in the context of the overarching theme of spiritual progress, reveal the dissertation to be solidly at the level of doctoral degree accreditation. Ms. Imanishi's committee members believe that her work adds important new insights into George MacDonald's importance as a fantasy writer and that her work shows excellent potential for future scholarship.

#### 4. 最終試験の概要

On Saturday January 30th the four members of Shizuha Imanishi's PhD committee, Professor Dorsey Kleitz (advisor), Professor Akira Hongo, Professor Noriyuki Harada (outside examiner and former advisor), and Professor Ariko Kawabata (outside examiner), conducted a viva voce examination putting to Ms. Imanishi questions and issues raised by her dissertation. Because of the current Covid-19 pandemic, Ms. Imanishi's PhD examination took place via the Zoom online platform.

Ms. Imanishi's viva was divided into a sixty-minute session (2:00-3:00) open to the public at which she gave a twenty-minute presentation on her dissertation followed by general comments and questions by the committee members and members of the public. This was followed by a ninety-minute private session (3:20-4:50) during which committee members asked more detailed chapter by chapter questions and made more specific comments.

In the public session and in the private session it was noted that since Ms. Imanishi's Preliminary Viva in September 2020, she made significant revisions to her dissertation following suggestions she received from her PhD committee at that time. Indeed, committee members generally agreed that the revisions to the dissertation were exemplary, resulting in a sharper, clearer, better-written and better-developed text with very few problems.

Ms. Imanishi handled the questions put to her at both the public and private sessions with a confidence that revealed the depth of her research along with a solid

knowledge of her subject matter. Questions in the private session of the viva dealt with MacDonald's indirect portrayal of Victorian social problems in his fairy tales, the unusual names he gives to his characters, his relationship with his contemporaries, such as William Morris and the Pre-Raphaelites, and detailed questions on the important aspects of the shadow in MacDonald's work. Ms. Imanishi's answers to these questions and others were clear and insightful. Her dissertation contains a number of terms, such as self, soul, and spirit, that are closely connected to her theme of spiritual progress in George MacDonald's fairy tales. The abstract nature of these terms makes them especially difficult to define. Ms. Imanishi admitted that they present particular problems in her discussion and readily agreed they need more precise clarification in her future work on George MacDonald. Potential areas of future research were also discussed, including MacDonald's influence on the Chronicles of Narnia by C.S. Lewis, his influence on the Dark Materials trilogy by twenty-first century fantasy writer Philip Pullman, and the role of women in MacDonald's work, particularly as it relates to the shadow and to spiritual development.

On Friday January 29th starting at 10:00, Ms. Imanishi took a French language examination. From her good result, it was judged that she has a sufficient academic ability in foreign languages.